MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE
COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS HELD ON JANUARY 23, 1914.

The third meeting of the Commission of Fine Arts during the fiscal year 1914 was held in their office in the Lemon Building, 1729 New York avenue, NW., Washington, D. C., on Friday, January 23, 1914. The following members were present:

Daniel C. French, Chairman;

Frederick Law Olmsted;

Thomas Hastings;

Cass Gilbert;

Edwin H. Blashfield;

also Colonel Wm. W. Harts, U. S. Army, the Secretary and Executive Officer.

The meeting was called to order by the Chairman at 9:15 a. m., and proceeded at once to the business before it.

1. MINUTES OF PRECEDING MEETING: The minutes of the preceding meeting, held on November 21, 1913, were presented and approved.

2. FINAL FULL-SIZED MODELS FOR GUILFORD COURT HOUSE, N. C., MONUMENT: The Secretary laid before the Commission the request of the Secretary of War that the Commission examine and report upon the full-sized models for the Guilford C. H., N. C., monument at the studio of the sculptor, Mr. F. H. Packer, when completed and ready for casting. Upon motion the sculptor member of the commission(Mr. French) was appointed a committee, with power, to inspect and report to the Secretary of War in the matter.

3. MARBLE BUST OF LATE CHIEF JUSTICE FULLER: Colonel Harts next read the request of the Joint Committee on the Library for a report upon the marble bust of the late Chief Justice Fuller, executed by William Ordway Partridge, sculptor. Upon motion Mr. French was appointed a committee of one, with power, to inspect and report upon this bust. Mr. French, accompanied by Mr. Olmsted and Mr. Blashfield, later in the day made an inspection

of the bust in the rooms of the Senate Committee on the Library and reported that, while in character and portraiture the bust is acceptable, it does not meet the requirements in regard to the technique, which seems careless and wanting in sculptural quality. He therefore advised that the sculptor be asked to give additional study to the marble with a view to carrying it further and to rendering the forms with more definiteness. (See Exhibit A.)

4. RED CROSS BUILDING AND SITE: The Commission next considered the request of the Secretary of War, Chairman of the Commission on the Red Cross Building to Commemorate the Women of the Civil War, for their consideration of the design and plans for the proposed Red Cross building, prepared by Messrs. Trowbridge and Livingston, architect, of New York City, as well as of the site for that building (Square 172 in the city of Washington). Mr. Trowbridge appeared before the Commission and discussed the design with the members. Upon motion the Commission approved the design and the site for the building, with the understanding that the building is to be executed in a light pink Knoxville marble, similar to the sample which was submitted, or in white marble. (See Exhibit B.)

5. MARBLE FOR LINCOLN MEMORIAL: The Secretary thereupon placed before the Commission a letter from the Secretary of War, requesting their advice upon certain questions which had arisen in connection with the selection of a suitable marble to be used in the construction of the Lincoln Memorial. The Commission made a careful examination of all the samples of marble, which had been arranged for their inspection in the board room and the corridor leading to the rooms of the Commission. Mr. Henry Bacon, architect of the memorial, also appeared for a short time upon request to give some desired information regarding the samples submitted. After careful consideration the following replies to the inquiries of the Secretary of War were unanimously adopted, and transmitted to him.

Question No. 1. All things considered, are all of the samples of marble submitted with the bids such as would be proper and appropriate for sucha memorial?

Answer. In the opinion of the Commission not all the samples of marble submitted with the bids, regarded from an artistic standpoint, are appropriate for such a memorial.

Question No. 2. If they are not all of that character, which one or ones are?

Answer. In the opinion of the Commission there are more than one of the marbles out of which the memorial might be constructed without serious sacrifice of its artistic quality. The distinction between these marbles and those which are artistically unacceptable is a matter of degree, and it is very difficult to draw an arbitrary line between the two classes. Because of this, and in view of the preeminent artistic fitness of one of the more acceptable marbles, the Commission feel that it is unwise and unnecessary arbitrarily to place all of the marbles in separate lists, as acceptable and unacceptable.

Question No. 3. Whether, having regard to the artistic conception of the structure, any of these marbles is so preeminently and peculiarly fitted, as compared with the others, as to be the only one meeting the artistic requirements of the structure?

Answer. The artistic qualities of the Colorado-Yule marble as compared with the others submitted, in the opinion of the Commission of Fine Arts, fit it preeminently for a structure of the character of the Lincoln Memorial.

A formal inquiry from Hon. William H. Taft, Chairman of the Lincoln Memorial Commission, as to whether in the judgment of the Commission of Fine Arts, the Colorado-Yule marble is or is not, from an artistic and aesthetic standpoint, sufficiently superior to the other marbles offered for use in the superstructure of the Lincoln Memorial as designed to justify its additional cost, and to justify the alterations in the original design and specifications already recommended and directed by the Lincoln Memorial Commission, also received careful attention and consideration. The Commission felt that the reply made the Secretary of War would answer the inquiries of Mr. Taft, and directed Colonel Harts to ascertain from the Secretary whether there would be any objection to furnishing Mr. Taft a copy of this reply; if not, a copy was directed to be sent him. This copy was transmitted later. (See Exhibit C for letter to Secretary of War and Exhibit D for schedule of marbles submitted and examined.)

6. WILLOW TREE ALLEY: A plan for the improvement of Willow Tree Alley, submitted by the Office of Public Buildings and Grounds, was discussed with Colonel Harts, in charge of that office, and Mr. Burnap, landscape architect, and was approved.

7. RESERVATIONS ALONG PENNSYLVANIA AVENUE BETWEEN WASHINGTON CIRCLE AND 17th STREET: Plans for the improvementof four small reservations between Washington Circle and 17th street, northwest, along Pennsylvania avenue, prepared and submitted by the Office of Public Buildings and Grounds, were also discussed with Colonel Harts and Mr. Burnap. The Commission made suggestions for a further study of these plans.

8. ARBORETUM FOR EAST POTOMAC PARK: Colonel Harts, Officer in charge of Public Buildings and Grounds, next requested the advice of the Commission upon the desirability of an arboretum for East Potomac Park. The Commission stated that this had been recommended in the Park Commission Report of 1902, and again affirmed that such an arboretum thus located would be very desirable.

9. GOLF COURSE FOR EAST POTOMAC PARK: The Officer in charge of Public Buildings and Grounds also brought before the Commission the question of the golf course for East Potomac Park, and of procuring the assistance of an expert in laying out such a course. The Commission felt that a golf course would be an attractive and popular feature of the park, and advised Colonel Harts that the services of an expert be obtained to assist the landscape architect in the preparation of such a plan.

10. MERIDIAN HILL PARK: Colonel Harts, Officer in charge of Public Buildings and Grounds, submitted to the Commission third preliminary designs for the treatment of Meridian Hill Park which were a development of earlier preliminary designs that had been previously submitted to the Commission and approved by them. Mr. Burnap, landscape architect of the office of Public Buildings and Grounds, was present for consultation. The Commission inspected the designsand approved them in their present stage, and made recommendations and suggestions which will be followed out in their further development. (Meridian Hill plans # 327/6B - 10 A - 10B - 11 and 12, Office, P. B. & G.)

11. BOTANIC GARDEN: Colonel Harts placed before the Commission a resolution from

the Joint Committee on the Library , which read as follows:

> "That the officer in charge of public buildings and grounds be requested to report to the Committee at its next meeting a plan for the termination of the use of the ground now occupied by the Botanic Garden, as such, with reference to the unveiling of the Grant Memorial erected on these grounds; but before making such report, said office should consult with the Commission of Fine Arts with reference to the subject.",

and stated that the Office of Public Buildings and Grounds at the same time requested advice regarding the removal of the United States Propagating Gardens, now situated immediately south of the Washington monument and west of the Bureau of Engraving and Printing. The Commission advised that the Botanic Garden be temporarily consolidated with the Propagating Gardens, and that plans be prepared for the removal of both of them to East Potomac Park. The Commission made various important suggestions to Colonel Harts and Mr. Burnap, who was present in consultation, asto the best present treatment of the Botanic Garden area with the view of an ultimate treatment as proposed by the Park Commission of 1902. Mr. French, Mr. Blashfield, and Mr. Olmsted also inspected the Botanic Garden later in the day. (memo: See action of Com. on Dec. 3, 1915, in re Botanic Garden, superseding above.) asc

12. PROPOSED CONNECTION BETWEEN POTOMAC PARK AND ROCK CREEK PARK: Colonel Harts also placed before the Commission informally several plans prepared in his office, showing two alternate schemes for the location of the roadway to connect Potomac Park with Rock Creek Park. The Commission considered either of the schemes shown better than a connecting viaduct, as previously proposed, and expressed special interest in the plan showing the roadway crossing Rock Creek near the mouth of the crest.

13. LETTER FROM CONGRESSMAN CARY, OF WISCONSIN: The Chairman brought to the attention of the Commission a communication to him from Congressman Cary of Wisconsin regarding the selection of marble for the Lincoln Memorial. No action was taken.

14. ADJOURNMENT: After some discussion of the matter of the expiration of the terms of the majority of the present members of the Commission, who were appointed to serve until June 15, 1914 "and until their successors are appointed and qualified", the Commission adjourned, at 1:45 p. m., subject to the call of the Chairman.

Colonel, U. S. Army,
Secretary and Executive Officer.

Approved: Daniel C. French.

Chairman.

C O P Y

January 26, 1914.

Hon. Luke Lea,
Chairman, Joint Committee on the Library,
United States Senate.

Sir:

In compliance with the request of the Joint Committee on the Library, the Commission of Fine Arts has examined the bust in marble of the late Chief Justice Fuller in the rooms of the Senate Committee on the Library and begs to report that, while in character and portraiture the bust is acceptable, it does not meet the requirements in regard to technique, which seems careless and wanting in sculptural quality. It would seem to be quite possible to remedy these defects in the present marble without the necessity for carving the bust anew, and the Commission of Fine Arts advises that the sculptor be asked to give additional study to the marble with a view to carrying it further and to rendering the forms with more definiteness.

By direction of the Commission:

Very respectfully,

WM W HARTS

Colonel, U. S. Army,

Secretary and Executive Officer.

ABC

"A"

January 23, 1914.

The Honorable
The Secretary of War,
Chairman, Commission on Red Cross Building to
Commemorate the Women of the Civil War,
War Department.

Sir:

The Commission of Fine Arts, at their meeting today, gave most careful consideration to the question of a site for the proposed Red Cross Building, and the design for that building, prepared by Messrs. Trowbridge and Livingston, submitted with your letter of January 21, 1914. The Commission approves the site (Square 172 in the City of Washington) and the design for the building, as submitted, with the understanding that the latter is to be executed in a light pink Knoxville marble, similar to the sample submitted, or in white marble.

Respectfully,

D. C. FRENCH

Chairman.

"B"

January 23, 1914.

The Honorable

The Secretary of War.

Sir:

The Commission of Fine Arts, at their meeting held today, gave most careful consideration to your letter of January 17, 1914, requesting their advice upon certain questions arising in connection with the selection of a suitable marble for the construction of the Lincoln Memorial. The Commission made a careful inspection of all the samples of marble submitted and have the honor to transmit the following replies to your inquiries:

1. In the opinion of the Commission not all the samples of marble submitted with the bids, regarded from an artistic standpoint, are appropriate for such a memorial.

2. In the opinion of the Commission there are more than one of the marbles out of which the memorial might be constructed without serious sacrifice of its artistic quality. The distinction between these marbles and those which are artistically unacceptable is a matter of degree, and it is very difficult to draw an arbitrary line between the two classes. Because of this, and in view of the preeminent artistic fitness of one of the more acceptable marbles, the Commission feel that it is unwise and unnecessary arbitrarily to place all of the marbles in separate lists, as acceptable and unacceptable.

3. The artistic qualities of the Colorado-Yule marble as compared with the others submitted, in the opinion of the Commission of Fine Arts, fit it preeminently for a structure of the character of the Lincoln Memorial.

Very respectfully,

D. C. FRENCH

Chairman.

MARBLES EXAMINED BY THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS AT THEIR MEETING ON FRIDAY, JANUARY 23, 1914, SUBMITTED FOR USE IN LINCOLN MEMORIAL SUPERSTRUCTURE:

NAME.	Number of samples submitted.
Lee Marble, submitted by Lee Marble Company, Lee, Mass.	2
Vermont Marble, submitted by Vermont Marble Co.,	3
Kenesaw, Georgia, Marble	2
Cherokee, Georgia, Marble,	5 small & 3 large
Southern Marble Co., Marble,	2 large & 1 small
East Dorset, Vt., Marble	2
South Dover, Wingdale, N. Y., Marble,	1
Asbury Gray, from Asbury Marble Co., Knoxville, Tenn.,	1
Gray Eagle Gray, Gray Eagle Marble Co., Knoxville, Tenn.,	1
Kingwood Stones from Kingwood Quarries,	6
Amicalola Marble,	4 large & 1 small
Beaver Dam Marble Co.,	5
Colorado-Yule Marble,	7
Not marked or identified,	5
	51 in all.

O. K.

A B C

"D"